



Dr. Jennifer McCormick
Superintendent of Public Instruction

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

Working Together for Student Success

TO: State Board of Education
FROM: Dr. Charity Flores
DATE: March 6, 2019
RE: ILEARN U.S. Government ECA Standard Setting

The Indiana Department of Education (IDOE) conducted ILEARN U.S. Government End-of-Course (ECA) Standard Setting meetings February 11-12, 2019. The Angoff methodology was confirmed by the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC). Educators with content expertise with the Indiana Academic Standards for U.S. Government comprised the panel both days. IDOE requests State Board approval of the following:

- Performance Level Descriptors delineating content expectations for Indiana Academic Standards for U.S. Government confirmed by educator committee.
- Raw cut score for “At Proficiency” placed at 26 items out of 54.

The Department will confirm these recommended cuts following the 2019 administration based on performance data. Any subsequent recommendations will be brought forward to the Board for additional review.

Table 1. Performance Level Descriptors by Indiana Academic Standard

	Standard	At Proficiency
Functions of Government		
USG.1.1	Define civic life, political life, and private life and describe the activities of individuals in each of these spheres. (Individuals, Society and Culture)	Define civic life, political life, and private life and describe activities individuals perform in each area.
USG.1.2	Define the terms and explain the relationship between politics, government, and public policy. (Economics)	Define the terms and explain relationships between politics, government, and public policy.
USG.1.3	Interpret the purposes and functions of government found in the Preamble of the United States Constitution. (Economics)	Interpret the purposes and functions of government found in the Preamble of the United States Constitution.
USG.1.4	Compare and contrast types of government including direct democracy, monarchy, oligarchy, and totalitarianism. (History; Individuals, Society and Culture)	Compare and contrast types of government including direct democracy, monarchy, oligarchy, and totalitarianism.
USG.1.5	Compare and contrast characteristics of limited and unlimited governments and provide historical and contemporary examples of each type of	Compare and contrast characteristics of limited and unlimited governments and provide historical and contemporary examples of each.

	government.	
USG.1.6	Compare and contrast unitary, confederate, and federal systems of government.	Compare and contrast unitary, confederate, and federal systems of government.
USG.1.7	Define and provide examples of constitutionalism, rule of law, limited government, and popular sovereignty in the United States Constitution and explain the relationship of these constitutional principles to the protection of the rights of individuals. (History; Individuals, Society and Culture)	Define and provide examples of constitutionalism, rule of law, limited government, and popular sovereignty in the United States Constitution and explain the relationship to the protection of individual rights.
USG.1.8	Evaluate the importance of a written constitution in establishing and maintaining the principles of rule of law and limited government.	Evaluate the importance of a written constitution as it relates to maintaining the rule of law and limited government.
USG.1.9	Evaluate how the United States Constitution establishes majority rule while protecting minority rights and balances the common good with individual liberties. (History; Individuals, Society and Culture)	Evaluate how the United States Constitution establishes majority rule while protecting minority rights and balances the common good with individual liberties.
USG.2.8	Explain the history and provide historical and contemporary examples of fundamental principles and values of American political and civic life, including liberty, security, the common good, justice, equality, law and order, rights of individuals, diversity, popular sovereignty, and representative democracy. (Individuals, Society and Culture)	Explain the history and provide past and present examples of fundamental principles and values of American political and civic life, including liberty, security, the common good, justice, equality, law and order, rights of individuals, diversity, popular sovereignty, and representative democracy.
USG.4.1	Compare and contrast governments throughout the world with the United States government in terms of source of the government's power.	Compare and contrast the source of power between the United States government and other world governments.
USG.4.2	Describe how different governments interact in world affairs. (Individuals, Society and Culture)	Describe how different governments interact in world affairs.
USG.4.3	Analyze reasons for conflict among nations, such as competition for resources and territory, differences in ideology, and religious or ethnic conflicts.	Analyze reasons for conflict among nations regarding competition for resources and territory, differences in ideology, and religious or ethnic conflicts.
USG.4.4	Provide examples of governmental and non-governmental international organizations and explain their role in international affairs.	Provide an example of a governmental or non-governmental international organization and explain the role this organization plays in world affairs.

USG.4.6	Identify and describe strategies available to the United States government to achieve foreign policy objectives. (Economics; Geography; History; Individuals, Society and Culture)	Identify and describe strategies available to the United States government to achieve foreign policy objectives.
USG.4.7	Examine the influence individuals, businesses, labor, and other organizations, interest groups, and public opinion has on United States foreign policy. (Economics)	Examine the influence individuals, businesses, labor, organizations, interest groups, and public opinion has on United States foreign policy.
USG.4.8	Identify and explain world issues, including political, cultural, demographic, economic and environmental challenges that affect the United States foreign policy in specific regions of the world.	Identify and explain a world issue, such as a political, cultural, demographic, economic, or environmental challenge that affects United States foreign policy in a specific region of the world.
USG.4.9	Discuss specific foreign policy issues that impact local community and state interests. (Economics; Individuals, Society and Culture)	Discuss specific foreign policy issues that impact local community and state interests.
USG.5.1	Define the legal meaning of citizenship in the United States; identify the requirements for citizenship in the United States and residency in Indiana and understand the criteria used for attaining both.	Define the legal meaning and identify the requirements of citizenship in the United States and residency in Indiana and understand the criteria used for attaining both.
USG.5.2	Analyze the roles and responsibilities of citizens in Indiana and the United States. (Individuals, Society and Culture)	Analyze the roles and responsibilities of citizens in Indiana and the United States.
USG.5.3	Discuss the individual's legal obligation to obey the law, serve as a juror, and pay taxes.	Discuss the individual's legal obligation to obey the law, serve as a juror, and pay taxes.
USG.5.5	Identify when it is constitutional for our government to limit the rights of individuals and explain the reasons why the government would want to do this. (History)	Identify or explain when and why our government can constitutionally limit an individual's rights.
USG.5.8	Describe opportunities available to individuals to contribute to the well-being of their communities and participate responsibly in the political process at local, state and national levels of government.	Describe the opportunities available to, and responsible participation of, individuals in the political process to contribution to a community's well-being at local, state and national levels of government.
Historical Foundations of American Government		
USG.2.1	Summarize the colonial, revolutionary, and Founding-Era experiences and events that led to the writing, ratification, and implementation of the United States Constitution (1787) and	Summarize the experiences that led to the creation of the U.S. Constitution and the Bill of Rights as our governing documents.

	Bill of Rights (1791). (History; Individuals, Society and Culture)	
USG.2.2	Understand the concept of compromise and evaluate its application during the Constitutional Convention.	Explain the concept of compromise and evaluate its application during the Constitutional Convention.
USG.2.3	Analyze and interpret central ideas on government, individual rights, and the common good in founding documents of the United States.	Analyze and interpret a central idea about government, individual rights, or the common good in founding documents of the United States.
USG.2.4	Explain the history and provide examples of foundational ideas of American government embedded in the Founding-Era documents such as: natural rights philosophy, social contract, popular sovereignty, constitutionalism, representative democracy, political factions, federalism, and individual rights.	Explain the history and provide examples of foundational ideas of American government embedded in the Founding -Era documents.
USG.2.5	Identify and explain elements of the social contract and natural rights theories in United States Founding-Era documents.	Identify and explain elements of the social contract and natural rights theories in United States Founding-Era documents.
USG.2.6	Explain how a shared American civic identity is based on commitment to foundational ideas in Founding-Era documents and in core documents of subsequent periods of United States history. (History)	Explain how American civic identity is based on the Founding-Era and subsequent documents of United States history.
USG.2.7	Using primary documents, compare and contrast the ideas of the Federalists and the Anti-Federalists regarding the respective roles of state and national government on ratification of the United States Constitution (1787–1788). (History)	Using primary documents, compare and contrast the ideas of the Federalists and the Anti-Federalists regarding the respective roles of state and national government on ratification of the United States Constitution (1787–1788).
USG.3.14	Analyze the election of Benjamin Harrison, Indiana’s only president, his approach to the presidency, his relationship to the legislative branch, and his re-election defeat, considering the effects of party politics and public opinion.	Analyze the election of Benjamin Harrison, his approach to the presidency, his relationship to the legislative branch, and his re-election defeat considering the effects of party politics and public opinion.
Institutions and Processes of Government		
USG.3.1	Analyze the United States Constitution and explain characteristics of government in the United States, which define it as a federal, presidential, constitutional and representative	Analyze a characteristic of the United States government that defines it as a federal, presidential, and representative democracy.

	democracy.	
USG.3.2	Explain the constitutional principles of federalism, separation of powers, the system of checks and balances, republican government or representative democracy, and popular sovereignty; provide examples of these principles in the governments of the United States and the state of Indiana.	Explain constitutional principles of federalism, separation of powers, checks and balances, representative democracy or republican government, and popular sovereignty, providing examples from Indiana and U.S. government.
USG.3.3	Identify and describe provisions of the United States Constitution and the Indiana Constitution that define and distribute powers and authority of the federal or state government.	Identify and describe provisions of the United States Constitution and the Indiana Constitution that define and distribute powers and authority of the federal or state government.
USG.3.4	Explain the relationship between limited government and a market economy. (Economics)	Explain the relationship between limited government and a market economy.
USG.3.5	Explain the section of Article IV, Section 4, of the United States Constitution which says, "The United States shall guarantee to every State in the Union a Republican form of government."	Explain the guarantee clause of Article IV, Section 4, of the United States Constitution.
USG.3.6	Compare and contrast the enumerated, implied and denied powers in the United States Constitution and the Indiana Constitution.	Compare and contrast the enumerated, implied and denied powers of the U.S. and Indiana Constitutions.
USG.3.7	Explain the relationships among branches of the United States government and Indiana government, which involve separation and sharing of powers as a means to limited government.	Explain the relationships among branches of the United States government and Indiana government, which involve separation and sharing of powers as a means to limited government.
USG.3.8	Describe the fiscal and monetary policies incorporated by the United States government and Indiana government and evaluate how they affect individuals, groups and businesses. (Economics)	Describe and evaluate how the fiscal and monetary policies of the U.S. and Indiana governments affect individuals, groups and businesses.
USG.3.9	Explain how a bill becomes law in the legislative process of the United States and the state of Indiana.	Explain how a bill becomes law in the legislative process of the United States and the state of Indiana.
USG.3.10	Describe the procedures for amending the United States and Indiana Constitutions and analyze why it is so difficult to amend these Constitutions.	Describe and evaluate the procedures and difficulties for amending the United States and Indiana Constitutions.
USG.3.11	Analyze the functions of the judicial branch of the United States and Indiana governments with emphasis on the principles of due process, judicial review and an independent judiciary.	Analyze functions of the judicial branch of the United States and Indiana governments, including the principles of due process and judicial review.

USG.3.12	Analyze the functions of major departments of the executive branch in the United States and in Indiana. (Individuals, Society and Culture)	Analyze the functions of major departments of the executive branch in the United States and in Indiana.
USG.3.13	Explain the electoral process in terms of election laws and election systems on the national, state and local level.	Explain the electoral process as it relates to national, state, and local election laws and election systems.
USG.3.15	Summarize the evolution of political parties and their ideologies in the American governmental system and analyze their functions in elections and government at national, state and local levels of the federal system. (History; Individuals, Society and Culture)	Summarize the ideologies and evolution of national, state, and local political parties in the American governmental system.
USG.3.16	Explain and evaluate the original purpose and function of the Electoral College and its relevance today.	Explain and evaluate the original purpose and function of the Electoral College and its relevance today.
USG.3.17	Explain the organization of state and local governments in Indiana and analyze how they affect the lives of citizens.	Explain the organization of state and local governments in Indiana and how they affect the lives of citizens.
USG.3.18	Identify the role and development of special interest groups in politics and explain their impact on the development of state and local public policy. (Economics; History; Individuals, Society and Culture)	Identify and explain the role and development of special interest groups in politics and their impact on the development of state and local public policy.
USG.3.19	Identify the historical significance of and analyze decisions by the United States Supreme Court about the constitutional principles of separation of powers and checks and balances in such landmark cases as Marbury v. Madison (1803), Baker v. Carr (1962), United States v. Nixon (1974), Clinton v. City of New York (1998) and Bush v. Gore (2000).	Identify and analyze the historical significance of decisions by the United States Supreme Court about the constitutional principles of separation of powers and checks and balances in landmark cases.
USG.3.20	Identify the historical significance of and analyze decisions by the United States Supreme Court about the constitutional principle of federalism in cases such as McCulloch v. Maryland (1819), Alden v. Maine (1999) and the denial of certiorari for the Terri Schiavo case (2005). (History; Individuals, Society and Culture) certiorari: a writ from a high court to a low court requesting a transcript of the proceedings of a case for review	Identify and analyze the historical significance of decisions by the United States Supreme Court about the constitutional principle of federalism in key court cases.
USG.3.21	Describe the influence of the media and technology on public opinion and public policy.	Describe how the use of media and technology has influenced public opinion and public policy.

USG.4.5	Analyze powers the United States Constitution gives to the executive, legislative and judicial branches of government in the area of foreign affairs.	Analyze powers the United States Constitution gives to the executive, legislative and judicial branches of government in the area of foreign affairs.
USG.5.4	Identify and describe the civil and constitutional rights found in the United States Constitution and Bill of Rights and expanded by decisions of the United States Supreme Court; analyze and evaluate landmark cases of the United States Supreme Court concerning civil rights and liberties of individuals.	Identify and describe the civil and constitutional rights found in the United States Constitution and Bill of Rights and expanded by decisions of the United States Supreme Court in landmark cases.
USG.5.6	Explain and give examples of important citizen actions that monitor and influence local, state, and national government as individuals and members of interest groups.	Explain and give an example of an important citizen action that monitors and influences the local, state, or national government as an individual or as a member of an interest group.
USG.5.7	Explain how citizens in the United States participate in public elections as voters and supporters of candidates for public office.	Explain how a United States citizen participates in a public election as a voter or a supporter of a candidate for public office.
USG.5.9	Use information from a variety of resources to describe and discuss current American political issues. (History, Economics, Geography)	Describe information from a variety of resources regarding current American political issues.

Executive Summary of U.S. Government Standard Setting

Background

Because the standard-setting workshop was conducted prior to administration of any test items, a standard-setting method that did not rely on item difficulty, student ability, or impact data was required. The Angoff method of standard setting (Angoff, 1971) provided a test-centered, research-based procedure that could be implemented in the absence of item statistics and was approved by the Indiana Technical Advisory Committee in October 2018.

Overview of Standard-Setting Activities

The Indiana Department of Education (IDOE) implemented a standard-setting workshop to recommend a proficient performance standard to demarcate student performance between “At Proficiency” and “Below Proficiency” with respect to the Indiana Academic Standards in U.S. Government. The standard-setting workshop was conducted February 11–12, 2019, with educators from around Indiana, to identify and recommend to IDOE the test score on the spring 2019 U.S. Government test associated with a proficient level of performance.

The workshop began by orienting panelists to the workshop activities. Major workshop activities included the following: development of range performance level descriptors (PLDs), “just barely” PLDs; review of test items; and the assignment of the probability that a “just barely” proficient student would respond correctly to each test item. Panelists received training prior to beginning each workshop activity.

The test form was presented to panelists electronically. Panelists interacted with items in the same way as they are administered to students. In their review of test items, panelists were instructed to think about what students need to know and be able to do to respond successfully to each item.

The workshop facilitator trained panelists to assign probability estimates to test items using a set of U.S. Government practice items. The facilitator worked through each practice item with the panel. The facilitator and panelists discussed the knowledge and skill requirements of the practice item, and panelists shared their judgments about how likely a “just barely” proficient student would respond correctly to the item and their rationale for making the assignment.

Discussions focused on performance of students just barely meeting the proficient standard to ensure that panelists were basing their judgments on the special group of students just qualifying for entry into the proficient performance level.

Panelists then logged into the standard-setting tool developed by the American Institutes for Research (AIR) to practice performing the Angoff judgment task using a six-item practice test form. Panelists worked to evaluate the knowledge and skill requirements of the practice items with respect to their “just barely” PLDs to assign a probability that just barely proficient students would respond correctly to each item and to practice assigning the probability in the standard-setting tool.

Upon completion of training, panelists signed the round 1 Readiness Form indicating that they understood the task and were ready to make their recommendations. Panelists received and

discussed feedback from their round 1 ratings for tables and the entire room. The feedback was in the form of statistics that described the central tendency and variability of the panelists' ratings. The facilitator worked with the room as a whole to discuss items with the greatest variation among panelists.

Following round 1 feedback and panel discussions, panelists performed the judgment task a second time in round 2. Panelists were instructed to consider feedback from round 1 and the characteristics of a student who just barely qualifies for entry into the proficient performance level. After signing the round 2 Readiness Form, each participant made an independent round 2 judgment about the probability that a just barely proficient student would respond correctly to each item in the test form.

Meeting Results

The round 2 (i.e., final) results are given in Table 2 for the 54 operational items. For each item, AIR computed the median probability that a just barely proficient student would respond correctly across all panelists. The sum of the median probability judgments was then used to compute the passing score on the first operational test form. The passing score based on round 2 judgments was 26 of 54 items correct.

The median probability judgments were stable between the two rounds. AIR was also interested in determining whether there was evidence of convergence in panelists' judgments following feedback and discussion in round 2. In round 1, the average interquartile range (IQR) of the probability judgments was 0.08, indicating substantial agreement among panelists even in round 1. In round 2, the average IQR was 0.07, indicating greater convergence among panelists' probability judgments, although the increase was small.

Table 2: Final Results

Position	Median	Minimum	Maximum	P25	P75	IQR
1	0.50	0.45	0.55	0.50	0.50	0.00
2	0.43	0.40	0.50	0.40	0.46	0.06
3	0.50	0.40	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
4	0.40	0.30	0.50	0.39	0.41	0.03
5	0.45	0.40	0.60	0.40	0.50	0.10
6	0.55	0.40	0.65	0.49	0.56	0.08
7	0.45	0.40	0.60	0.44	0.50	0.06
8	0.50	0.35	0.60	0.44	0.51	0.08
9	0.43	0.25	0.60	0.35	0.45	0.10
10	0.45	0.40	0.70	0.45	0.50	0.05
11	0.60	0.50	0.65	0.54	0.65	0.11
12	0.50	0.35	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
13	0.43	0.25	0.50	0.39	0.45	0.06
14	0.60	0.35	0.70	0.48	0.65	0.18
15	0.40	0.30	0.50	0.35	0.40	0.05
16	0.50	0.40	0.60	0.44	0.50	0.06
17	0.50	0.40	0.60	0.45	0.51	0.06
18	0.53	0.40	0.60	0.45	0.55	0.10
19	0.45	0.35	0.50	0.45	0.45	0.00
20	0.45	0.30	0.60	0.40	0.46	0.06
21	0.48	0.35	0.55	0.44	0.50	0.06
22	0.53	0.45	0.70	0.50	0.56	0.06
23	0.50	0.40	0.55	0.44	0.50	0.06
24	0.40	0.35	0.50	0.39	0.45	0.06
25	0.50	0.40	0.65	0.50	0.55	0.05
26	0.45	0.30	0.50	0.40	0.45	0.05
27	0.50	0.40	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
28	0.50	0.35	0.70	0.45	0.56	0.11
29	0.45	0.35	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
30	0.55	0.50	0.65	0.50	0.56	0.06
31	0.53	0.45	0.75	0.49	0.60	0.11
32	0.45	0.35	0.55	0.40	0.51	0.11

Position	Median	Minimum	Maximum	P25	P75	IQR
33	0.50	0.30	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
34	0.45	0.35	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
35	0.50	0.35	0.60	0.45	0.50	0.05
36	0.65	0.40	0.75	0.55	0.66	0.11
37	0.45	0.40	0.60	0.44	0.51	0.08
38	0.48	0.30	0.65	0.40	0.50	0.10
39	0.50	0.45	0.70	0.45	0.55	0.10
40	0.50	0.40	0.70	0.49	0.55	0.06
41	0.53	0.40	0.65	0.49	0.56	0.08
42	0.50	0.45	0.70	0.50	0.51	0.01
43	0.53	0.40	0.65	0.45	0.56	0.11
44	0.53	0.40	0.65	0.50	0.56	0.06
45	0.50	0.40	0.55	0.49	0.50	0.01
46	0.50	0.35	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
47	0.48	0.35	0.55	0.40	0.50	0.10
48	0.50	0.35	0.55	0.45	0.50	0.05
49	0.50	0.30	0.55	0.50	0.50	0.00
50	0.45	0.35	0.55	0.40	0.50	0.10
51	0.58	0.50	0.70	0.55	0.60	0.05
52	0.33	0.25	0.50	0.25	0.36	0.11
53	0.50	0.40	0.60	0.40	0.50	0.10
54	0.48	0.40	0.70	0.44	0.50	0.06

References

Angoff, W. H. (1971). Scales, norms, and equivalent scores. In R. L. Thorndike (Ed.), *Educational Measurement* (2nd ed.). Washington, DC: American Council on Education.