



## Indiana Department of Education

Dr. Katie Jenner, Secretary of Education

### **EXAMPLE: Evaluation Tool for High-Quality Curricular Materials for Early Learning (Infant to Age Five)**

The purpose of this evaluation tool is for reviewer(s) to consider each component independently in relationship to the overall rating defined. Each criteria (i.e., row) is defined as a yes/no determination. Criteria defined as a non-negotiable (Sections I, II, and III) must be indicated as “Yes” for further evaluation in Section IV (optional criteria). The review considers three specific process steps: 1) independent review by a credible third party research entity, 2) independent review by each educator reviewer, and 3) consensus by the Indiana Department of Education’s (IDOE’s) hosted review committee. Process steps and documentation provided by the curricular organization will inform the overall determination defined in step 3.

The reviewer(s) must complete the process for each row independently based on the evidence provided by the curricular organization. Anecdotes or research beyond what the organization explicitly provided will not inform ratings.

1. Review the **required** criteria in Sections I, II, and III and **optional** criteria in Section IV.
  - If there is a “Yes” for all required criteria (i.e., rows), materials receive an overall “Yes” for that section.
  - If there is a “No” for any of the required criteria (i.e., rows), materials receive an overall “No” for that section.
2. Materials must meet all required criteria in Sections I, II, and III. Criteria in Section IV are optional, but may serve as a point of differentiation across providers that successfully navigate the review process.
3. A curricular organization must receive an overall “Yes” in Sections I, II, and III to be deemed high-quality. Details about each organization’s rating completed by the independent third party research entity must be submitted with the corresponding documentation for review.

Submissions are evaluated on the extent to which they meet all of the criteria noted below. Deficient submissions will be allowed one additional submission round to provide additional evidence or clarification for reviewers. **The term “materials” is used throughout the rubric to mean “instructional materials” utilized by the educator or provided to students unless otherwise noted.**

**Section I: Early Learning Non-Negotiable Criteria for High-Quality Curricular Materials: Instruction**

Evidence must meet all criteria noted in Section I.

| Key Element Required   | Determination:<br>Yes/No | Notes/Evidence   |
|--|--------------------------|--|
| Curriculum includes at least 85% alignment with the 2023 Indiana Early Learning Standards.   | YES -                    | Attachment 1.1 Publisher Name_alignment.pdf<br><br>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 12-16)   |
| At least 95% of materials and activities provide opportunities and experiences for children to meet the Indiana Early Learning Standards while fostering development across each of the domains listed below: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Approaches to play and learning;</li> <li>• English/language arts</li> <li>• Math</li> <li>• Science</li> <li>• Social Studies</li> <li>• Student wellbeing</li> <li>• Physical health and growth</li> <li>• Creative arts</li> </ul> | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 25-35)<br><br>Attachment 1.3 Narrative Explanation for Indiana Early Learning Standards and Domains                 |
| Instructional framework addresses all age levels in a manner that is <b>systematic and sequential</b> . The framework has a comprehensive <b>scope and sequence</b> that includes a direct order in which skills are presented and allow for continued practice to build automaticity, skills building from the simple to more complex, and how knowledge and skills build and connect across age levels.  | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 36-40)<br><br>Attachment 1.4 Publisher Name_infant_scope.pdf<br><br>Attachment 1.5 Publisher Name_toddler_scope.pdf |

Example Evaluation: High-Quality Curricular Materials

|   |              |  |
|---|--------------|--|
|   |              | Attachment 1.6 Publisher Name_preschool_scope.pdf  |
| <p>Third-party research studies demonstrate the effectiveness of the program in early learning domains.</p>   | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 41-51)</p> <p>Attachment 1.7 Publisher Name_research_ela.pdf</p> <p>Attachment 1.8 Publisher Name_research_math.pdf</p> <p>Attachment 1.9 Publisher Name_research_play.pdf</p> <p>Attachment 1.10 Publisher Name_research_wellbeing.pdf</p> <p>Attachment 1.11 Publisher Name_research_sci.pdf</p> <p>Attachment 1.12 Publisher Name_research_ss.pdf</p> <p>Attachment 1.13 Publisher Name_research_ca.pdf</p> <p>Attachment 1.14 Publisher Name_research_physical.pdf</p> |
| <p>At least 95% of tasks include <b>differentiated support</b> to meet the needs of all students including but not limited to students with special learning needs and multilingual learners.</p> | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 52-57)</p> <p>Attachment 1.15 Narrative Explanation for Differentiated Support</p>   |

Example Evaluation: High-Quality Curricular Materials

|   |              |  |
|---|--------------|--|
| <p>All materials and activities focus on <b>responsive</b> caregiving (infant/toddler), relationships, interactions, and connections.</p>   | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 58-63)</p> <p>Attachment 1.16 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities with a Focus on Responsive Caregiving, Relationships, Interactions, and Connections</p> |
| <p>All materials and activities provide guidance for routines that support the <b>health and safety</b> of children.</p>  | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 63-68)</p> <p>Attachment 1.17 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities that Support Health and Safety</p>  |
| <p>All materials and activities are provided through both <b>teacher-directed and child-initiated</b> experiences (e.g., children are given substantial opportunities to choose interest areas/learning centers and activities within each).</p>  | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 69-74)</p> <p>Attachment 1.18 Narrative Explanation for Teacher-Directed and Child-Directed Experiences</p>  |
| <p>All materials and activities allow for opportunities for frequent practice of skills using <b>interactive and hands-on approaches</b> that directly connect to daily learning and are initiated by the child (e.g., does not support practice through the use of worksheets).</p>                              | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 75-80)</p> <p>Attachment 1.19 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities that are Interactive and Hands-On</p>   |
| <p>All materials and activities are included that are <b>reflective of differences</b> including race, family relationships, ethnicity, gender, religion, economic background, and ability.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Literature</li> <li>● Posters</li> <li>● Music</li> <li>● Art</li> </ul> | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 81-96)</p> <p>Attachment 1.20 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities that are Reflective of Differences</p>  |

Example Evaluation: High-Quality Curricular Materials

|  |              |   |
|--|--------------|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Thematic units</li> <li>• Family engagement activities</li> </ul> <p><i>Example:</i> Curriculum builds throughout the unit/year that allows opportunities for families to share their cultures.</p>   |              |   |
| <p>All materials and activities are incorporated throughout a <b>variety of settings</b> (indoor/outdoor), including whole group time, centers/ activity or interest areas, cooperative play, small group, and individualized attention.</p>   | <p>YES ▾</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 81-96)</p> <p>Attachment 1.20 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities that are Reflective of Differences</p>           |
| <p>All materials and activities optimally support children learning at <b>different developmental stages</b> (e.g., security for infants, exploration for mobile infants, identity for toddlers, language and literacy for preschool).</p>   | <p>YES ▾</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 97-107)</p> <p>Attachment 1.21 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities that are Different for Developmental Stages</p> |
| <p><b>Applicable to Ages 0-3</b><br/>         Infant and toddler language and early literacy development is emphasized through resources and activities that support (where developmentally appropriate):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Frequent talk and conversations during daily routines (e.g., diapering and transitions),</li> <li>• Social interactions and use of gestures, sounds, words, phrases, or simple sentences to communicate,</li> <li>• Open-ended questions,</li> <li>• Use of texts, including rhymes, finger plays, and music/songs, that are appropriate for each developmental stage,</li> <li>• Regular and repeated read-alouds (with close repetition) of texts related to a theme or topic (e.g., animals, cities, weather, etc.) in order to accelerate background knowledge and vocabulary development,</li> </ul> | <p>YES ▾</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 108-118)</p> <p>Attachment 1.22 Narrative Explanation for Infant and Toddler Language and Early Literacy Development</p>          |

Example Evaluation: High-Quality Curricular Materials

|  |              |   |
|--|--------------|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pre-writing skills (e.g., holding objects and scribbling or drawing/painting to convey a message), and</li> <li>• Print awareness (e.g., exploring, touching, and holding board books).</li> </ul>  |              |   |
| <p><b>Applicable to Ages 3-5</b><br/>Language and early literacy development is emphasized through resources and activities that support the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Regular read-alouds of appropriately complex narrative and informational texts related to a theme or topic (i.e., animals, cities, weather) in order to accelerate children’s background knowledge and vocabulary development,</li> <li>• Repeated read alouds build from enjoyment of the story and basic/literal comprehension to discussion of inferential questions and drawing or writing to express understanding,</li> <li>• Pacing and time-estimate of the given literacy lessons appropriate for the targeted age group,</li> <li>• Print awareness and letter knowledge (e.g., discusses print conventions in texts, identifies letters and sounds in print),</li> <li>• Phonological awareness activities that demonstrate understanding of different units of sound and language to the appropriate degree as stated by Indiana Early Learning Standards,</li> <li>• Early stages of writing (e.g., form shapes and letter like symbols) using a variety of tools, materials, and surfaces, and</li> <li>• Regular opportunities to communicate through appropriate written representation, symbols, and letters.</li> </ul> | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 119-129)</p> <p>Attachment 1.23 Narrative Explanation for Preschool Language and Early Literacy Development</p> |
| <p><b>Cognitive development and executive functioning</b> is emphasized, where developmentally appropriate, through resources and activities that support:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Understanding of basic math concepts (e.g., counting, comparing size, spatial relationships songs),</li> <li>• Development of scientific inquiry (e.g., observe, ask questions, predict, make comparisons, conduct scientific</li> </ul>   | <p>YES -</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 130-135)</p> <p>Attachment 1.24 Narrative Explanation for Cognitive Development and Executive Functioning</p>   |

Example Evaluation: High-Quality Curricular Materials

|   |              |  |
|---|--------------|--|
| <p>investigations, and simple experiments,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Perseverance and persistence to solve problems,</li> <li>● Curiosity and exploration,</li> <li>● Creative thinking (e.g., pretending, make-believe play, role playing), and</li> <li>● Awareness of rules and responsibilities.</li> </ul>  |              |  |
| <p>All <b>math</b> materials and activities are devoted to the development of understanding numbers, ways of representing numbers, and relationships between numbers and quantities consistent with the Indiana Early Learning Standards and to the development of understanding of data analysis, geometry, and measurement. All adhere to the following indicators of quality:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Promote children’s acquisition and use of the language and vocabulary of math;</li> <li>● Promote conceptual understanding of math content; and</li> <li>● Promote children’s development of perseverance and persistence in solving problems.</li> </ul> | <p>YES ▾</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 136-140)</p> <p>Attachment 1.25 Narrative Explanation for Mathematics</p>                              |
| <p>All materials provide a variety of <b>family engagement</b> activities to strengthen children’s learning and development, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Aligned activities,</li> <li>● Virtual portals,</li> <li>● Stories/books, and</li> <li>● Learning extensions to be completed at home.</li> </ul>   | <p>YES ▾</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 141-145)</p> <p>Attachment 1.26 Narrative Explanation for Materials that Promote Family Engagement</p> |

**Section II: Early Learning Non-Negotiable Criteria for High-Quality Curricular Materials: Assessment**

Evidence must meet all criteria noted in Section II.

| Key Element Required  | Determination:<br>Yes/No | Notes/Evidence   |
|---|--------------------------|--|
| Explicit guidance for all assessments includes scoring guides and student work examples for teachers and administrators to evaluate student performance.  | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 146-150)<br>Attachment 1.27 Narrative Explanation for Assessment  |
| Assessments consistent with the Indiana Early Learning Standards are provided through a variety of appropriate methods (e.g. anecdotal observations/notes, photographs, checklists, work samples, and family perspectives)              | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 146-150)<br>Attachment 1.27 Narrative Explanation for Assessment  |
| All materials and activities promote an ongoing process that includes observation, documentation, reflection, and adaptation to meet each child's interests and developmental needs in a variety of settings within the daily schedule. | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 151-156)<br>Attachment 1.28 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities that Promote Ongoing Processes |
| Assessment assures that current knowledge of each child's development is accurate. On-going assessment materials provide educators with developmental-stage resources.  | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 151-156)<br>Attachment 1.29 Publisher Name_assessment calendar.pdf  |



### Section III: Early Learning Non-Negotiable Criteria for High-Quality Curricular Materials: Professional Development and Educator Support

Evidence must meet all criteria noted in Section III.

| Key Element Required   | Determination:<br>Yes/No | Notes/Evidence  |
|--|--------------------------|---|
| At least one day of professional development opportunities and explicit guidance for implementation, coaching, and evaluation is provided.   | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 157-167)<br>Attachment 1.30 Narrative Explanation for Professional Development               |
| Explicit teacher language is outlined in all materials including concise and specific teacher language to introduce, define or explain new skills through demonstration and modeling before students are asked to practice newly learned skills. | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 168-170)<br>Attachment 1.31 Narrative Explanation for Teacher Language                       |
| All materials have clear and direct instructions that connect all curricular resources. All reading selections are centrally located within the materials and the center of focus.   | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 171-176)<br>Attachment 1.32 Narrative Explanation for Materials Connection and Reading Focus |
| All teacher edition materials include lesson annotations and support for engaging students in the materials as well as support for implementing ancillary and resource materials and student progress components.                                | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 168-180)<br>Attachment 1.32 Narrative Explanation for Teacher Edition                        |
| All materials are accessible in a variety of formats (e.g., braille, audio, large print/print, and digital).   | YES -                    | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 180-185)<br>Attachment 1.33 Narrative Explanation for  |

Example Evaluation: High-Quality Curricular Materials

|   |     |   |
|---|-----|---|
|   |     | Accessibility   |
| All lesson scripts are provided with explicit guidance to teach each concept in a systematic, cumulative way. | YES | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 168-180)<br>Attachment 1.34 Narrative Explanation for Lesson Scripts |

**Section IV: Early Learning Optional Criteria for High-Quality Curricular Materials**

Evidence may meet the additional criteria noted in Section IV to allow for a higher evaluation rating.

| Key Element Required  | Determination: Yes/No | Notes/Evidence   |
|---|-----------------------|--|
| Materials and activities are suggested that appeal to children’s interests in order to deepen motivation, enjoyment, and learning by ensuring suggestions are age-appropriate and reflective of differences including race, family relationships, ethnicity, gender, religion, economic background, and ability.  | YES                   | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 69-107)<br>Attachment 1.32 Narrative Explanation for Materials and Activities that Appeal to Children’s Interests |
| Activities include use of safe and appropriate intentionally selected toys and manipulatives (e.g., play dough, dolls, toy trucks/cars, stacking rings, nesting cups, blocks, puzzles, plastic animals, puppets, rattles and musical instruments, art materials, dress-up clothes, props, realistic-looking toys that represent items such as food) that can be used in a variety of ways to help children practice and develop new skills (e.g., fine motor, memory, listening, self-control, language, problem-solving, relationship-building, physical, spatial relations) and require the most action on the part of the child. | YES                   | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 69-107)<br>Attachment 1.33 Narrative Explanation for Activities   |
| Materials are available in appropriate formats (e.g., vinyl books and   | YES                   | Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis  |

Example Evaluation: High-Quality Curricular Materials

|   |              |  |
|---|--------------|--|
| <p>board books) and a variety of formats (e.g., print and non-print such as videos, art, music, charts, pictures, etc.).</p>  |              | <p>(pages 69-107)<br/>Attachment 1.34 Narrative Explanation for Formats</p>  |
| <p>Activities are flexible and allow for adjustments according to children’s needs and interests.</p>   | <p>YES ▾</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 52-57, 69-107)<br/>Attachment 1.35 Narrative Explanation for Flexibility and Differentiation</p>   |
| <p>Student wellbeing (as detailed below) is emphasized in materials and activities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Self awareness and confidence</li> <li>● Identification and expression of emotions</li> <li>● Self control</li> <li>● Conflict resolution</li> <li>● Relationship skills.</li> </ul> | <p>YES ▾</p> | <p>Attachment 1.2 Independent Analysis (pages 25-35)<br/>Attachment 1.3 Narrative Explanation for Indiana Early Learning Standards and Domains<br/>Attachment 1.10 Publisher Name_research_wellbeing.pdf<br/>Attachment 1.36 Narrative Explanation for Student Wellbeing</p> |