

**Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board Minutes**  
**April 28, 2010**  
**Indiana Government Conference Center**  
**Conference Room A**  
**302 West Washington Street**  
**Indianapolis, Indiana 46204**

Board members present: John Newman, Vice Chairman; William Selm, Julie Donnell, Richard Butler, Mitch Zoll and Dan Kloc

Staff members present: DHPA Director Dr. James Glass, Paul Diebold, Frank Hurdis, Amy Walker, Steve Kennedy, Miriam Widenhofer, Karie Brudis, Kim Robinson, David Duval, Amy Johnson, Holly Tate, Cathy Draeger-Williams, John Carr of DHPA and Susan Judy, DNR Admin Pool

Visitors/Speakers present included Ben Clark, James Davis, Link Ludington, Susan Branigin, Staffan Peterson, Eric Bruin, Russ Hopp, James Allbaugh, Patrick Carpenter, Connie Zeigler, Mildred Moore, James Moore, Robert Avenius, Luanna Albrecht, Deanna & Larry Robbins, Kim Dolbeer, Rebecca Smith, Eric Wyndham, and Ron McAhron

**Call to Order**

Vice-Chairman John Newman convened the meeting at 1:34 P. M.

The minutes from the January 27, 2010 board meeting were approved without any changes. Motion to approve was made by Dan Kloc and seconded by Richard Butler.

Vice-Chairman Newman sadly noted the passing of retired board member, Harry Murphy. He also stated that Mr. Murphy has been a member of the board since 2003 and would be missed as a member and associate. A memorial service has been set for May 15, 2010 in Bloomington.

Vice- Chairman Newman requested the Division Director's report.

Dr. James Glass reported for the Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology (DHPA)

**I. Division Director's Report:**

**Preserving Historic Places Conference**

The division, together with Indiana University Committee on Historic Preservation and Indiana Landmarks, hosted a very successful first Preserving Historic Places Conference in New Harmony earlier in the month of April. The 180 registrations, exceeded expectations and garnered many positive reactions by participants. The three plenary sessions on April 8 were highlights, and the Review Boards own Kent Schuette served as moderator for a memorable panel discussion on Modernism in New Harmony and later Kent himself made a presentation on "Sacred Geometry in the Design of New Harmony." DHPA staff moderated or led several educational sessions and

workshops. There was a good mix of topics involving hands-on preservation techniques, education and outreach, preservation advocacy and policy, and archaeology.

Jeannie Regan-Dinius served as coordinator for the conference and did an outstanding job of pulling together all of the pieces into a well organized, enjoyable experience. Dr Glass made a special mention and "thank you" to Jeannie Regan-Dinius for her outstanding work.

Next year's conference will be in Indianapolis in early April, and is expected to offer an even more comprehensive meeting featuring urban topics and issues in preservation and archaeology.

### 2010 Division Awards

At the Preserving Historic Places Conference, division staff presented our 2010 outstanding achievement awards. Franklin Heritage and the Fort Vallonia Days Association both received an Award for Outstanding Grant-Funded Rehabilitation; Franklin Heritage for their rehabilitation of the Artcraft Theatre in Franklin; and Fort Vallonia Association for their rehabilitation of the Joe Jackson Hotel in Fort Vallonia; The American United Life Insurance Company received the Historic Rehabilitation Achievement Award for its federal tax credit-assisted rehabilitation of the Gibson Co. Building in Indianapolis; and Emily and Brian Mack received the Award for Outstanding Certified Historic Homeowner Rehabilitation for their restoration of their Gustav Stickley-designed house in Irvington (Indianapolis) Indiana. The division recognized the Howard School Restoration Group, Inc. for their restoration of the one-room Howard School in Boone County. The 2010 Outstanding Hoosier Preservationist Award was presented to Stanley Madison of Gibson County for his vision and leadership over many years in accomplishing the restoration of the Lyles Station Consolidated School and creating greater public awareness and understanding of the Lyles Station African American rural community.

### Preservation Month

Historic Preservation Month 2010 begins in May. Amy Walker of our staff has been coordinating a calendar of events statewide that call attention to the value of preservation for Indiana communities.

DHPA is sponsoring several activities to mark Preservation Month. The 2010 Preservation Month photography contest had 22 entries. The entries are now on display at 8 locations around the state. Saturday, May 1, was the 2010 Grassroots Round-up in Whiting, Indiana. The round-up is an opportunity for preservationists in northwest Indiana to come together and share success stories and challenges they face and learn from each other.

On Tuesday, May 11, division staff members will be assisting the Indiana State Museum and State Historic Sites through a Work Day at Fort Knox II, an archaeological site operated by State Historic Sites near Vincennes, Indiana. Volunteers in the area along with some DHPA staff will be helping to replace posts that form a perimeter outlining the fort walls.

### Cemetery Restoration Workshops

On May 14-15, our division and the Indiana Historical Society will continue our partnership in holding a cemetery restoration workshop for beginners on how to probe appropriately for fallen cemetery memorials and how to restore them.

## Courthouse Preservation Advisory Commission

The Courthouse Preservation Advisory Commission, (CPAC), which DHPA helps staff, has organized its agenda to accomplish the General Assembly mandates assigned at its conception. Three different surveys are being carried out currently; one directed to county commissioners, a second to county judges, and a third completed by Indiana Landmarks staff members. All are aimed at compiling as much information as possible on the condition of the state's historic courthouses and the needs for rehabilitation and long-term preservation. Education efforts are proceeding by Commission members speaking at principal statewide and regional meetings of county commissioners, community foundations, and judges. Funds are being raised to pay for a report to be made to the General Assembly in 2011.

## Hoosier Heritage Day 2010

Through generous donations from private sources, DHPA will be able to continue the partnership among 14 state agencies and statewide heritage organizations to continue with Hoosier Heritage Day, which provides visitors to the Indiana State Fair with experiences involving Indiana history, preservation, and archaeology. This year's date is August 12, 2010.

## **II. National Register Applications**

Vice-Chairman Newman called for the National Register Applications but first he explained the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board and to guests in the audience not familiar with the process of nomination and application. Newman indicated that he had met with Jim Glass and requested additional guidance from the staff regarding the executive office request to expedite nomination discussion during the meetings. Newman asked Dr. Glass to further explain what listing in the National register means for the benefit of guests.

Comments on what listing in the National Register of Historic Places means:

It is primarily an official recognition by the State of Indiana and the nation as a whole that properties or historic districts listed are important to the prehistory, history, or architectural identity of a community or place.

Listing CAN do the following:

It can create greater awareness of the value of listed properties and sometimes open doors to preservation of particular properties.

Listing in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures, which occurs at the same time that the Review Board approves nominating properties for the National Register, qualifies homeowners to apply for a 20% state historic homeowners tax credit. The credit can be taken on 20% of the total qualified rehabilitation cost when a homeowner is renovating his or her home.

A couple of things that listing does not do:

It does not restrict the property rights of owners for listed properties in any way.  
It does not provide authority for the federal or state governments to acquire properties listed.

It does not raise the assessed value of properties listed for the purpose of assessing local property taxes.

**1. Thornhurst Addition Historic District, bounded by 650 to 742 W. Main, Thornhurst Dr., and Rogers Rd., Carmel, Hamilton Co. (2110)**

Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. Robert Avenius, resident of the Thornhurst area, supported the nomination and noted the concentration of singular architecture in the area and people looking at the architecture in the neighborhood. Rebecca Smith, Indiana Landmarks, has worked with the residents for several years and indicated she also supports the nomination. William Selm complimented the nomination preparer and staff for a job well done. A motion to approve was made by William Selm and seconded by Julie Donnell. The motion passed.

**2. Josephus Atkinson Farm, 4474 W. CR 400 S., Clymers vicinity, Cass Co. (2124)**

Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. Julie Donnell asked if Indiana has a document that discusses what constitutes a farm. Paul Diebold responded that the State held several workshops concerning this question some years ago. They work with applicants on a case by case basis and with the form preparer. Patrick Carpenter, INDOT, responded that the National Park Service has the guidelines. William Selm asked about a description of the barn. Selm also asked if the current owner has an abstract. He also stated that the word concrete should be used instead of the word cement because cement is used to make concrete. Newman commented that the Indiana State Library would have these details.

INDOT staff responded that no abstract was found and all the research was done that could be done.

A motion to approve was made by Richard Butler and seconded by Julie Donnell. The motion passed.

**3. Charles E. Nichols House, 231 W. Commercial Ave., Lowell, Lake Co. (2143)**

Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There was no discussion or questions. A motion to approve was made by Julie Donnell and seconded by William Selm. The motion passed.

**4. Union City School, 310 N. Walnut St., Union City, Randolph Co. (2135)**

Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. James Allbaugh represented the owner. He commented on the details of the rehabilitation done to the school and expressed his support in favor of the nomination. A motion to approve was made by William Selm and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed.

**5. Peabody Memorial Tower, 400 W. 7<sup>th</sup> St., North Manchester, Wabash Co. (2145)**

Frank Hurdis, DHPA, gave the staff comments. Julie Donnell asked if the architect, Charles Weatherhogg worked with a landscape architect. She also asked about the circular boundary and if

it were included. William Selm commented that columbaria should be called a mausoleum instead. Hurdis refuted Selm and indicated that columbaria was the appropriate term. Selm also stated he enjoyed the nomination. A motion to approve was made by Julie Donnell and seconded by William Selm. The motion passed.

**6. Haste-Crumpacker House, 208 N. Michigan St., Valparaiso, Porter Co. (2147)**

Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. William Selm quibbled about the first European land claim in 1783 or 1833, and that it should be European-American. John Newman added he believes it was the Indian claim. Selm also questioned whether or not the train stopped there or passed through and indicated that it should state the first Railroad arrived. A motion to approve was made by Dan Kloc and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed.

**7. Northern States Life Insurance Company, 5935 Hohman Ave., Hammond, Lake Co. (2148)**

Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There was no discussion or questions. A motion to approve was made by Richard Butler and seconded by William Selm. The motion passed.

**III. State Certificates of Approval**

**1. Application by the Indiana Department of Transportation for a certificate of approval to alter, by rehabilitation, the bridge on US 33 over the Elkhart River near the community of Benton in Benton Township, Elkhart County.**

John Carr, DHPA, gave the staff comments. William Selm gave his compliments to John Carr for clarifying some of the more challenging engineering problems such as the bridge inventory program, select, non-select and why the appearance will change. No additional mitigation is recommended beyond what is stipulated in the Section 106 review and MOA. Dan Kloc made a motion to approve the C of A. Richard Butler seconded that motion. A vote is taken on the motion - the motion was approved.

**2. Application by the Indiana State Museum and State Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to construct an ADA-compliant access ramp along the east elevation of Community House #2, New Harmony, Harmony Township, Posey County.**

Frank Hurdis, DHPA, gave staff comments. William Selm asked about the gravel surface of the ramp walkway - has compacted gravel been used before? Link Ludington, Museum and Historic Sites architectural historian, responded that it has but rarely. Dan Kloc made a motion to approve the C of A. Richard Butler seconded that motion. A vote is taken on the motion - the motion was approved.

**3. Application by the Indiana State Museum and State Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to construct a rubble mound breakwater of loose stones near the shore of Lake Sylvan, Gene Stratton-Porter State Historic Site, Rome City, Orange Township, Noble County.**

Frank Hurdis, DHPA, gave staff comments. Julie Donnell expressed concerned that the breakwater mound will look like rip-rap. Link Ludington responded it is rip-rap covered in rocks, it's not easy to have function as well as nice appearance but it will look as good as possible. There is really no other solution to protect the site. Richard Butler made a motion to approve the C of A. William Selm seconded that motion. A vote is taken on the motion - the motion was approved.

**4. Application by Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks & Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to place gravel on the path to Earthwork D, Mounds**

**State Park, Union Township, Madison County.** Cathy Draeger Williams, DHPA, gave staff comments. Mitch Zoll made a motion to approve the C of A. Richard Butler seconded that motion. A vote is taken on the motion - the motion was approved.

#### **IV. Historic Preservation Fund Grant Applications for FY 2010**

Steve Kennedy, Assistant Director of DHPA gave the fund grant report. Surveys in Fiscal year 2010 will be negotiated through cooperative agreements not grants.

A notice of the availability of the draft priorities for the Historic Preservation Fund Matching Grants Program was distributed entirely by e-mail this year for the first time. The communication directed our constituents to the DHPA's website to review the proposed grant evaluation criteria, the grant program guidelines, and the sliding scale funding recommendations and requested that any written comments be submitted to our office no later than Friday, April 23.

Several major changes have been made to the Architectural & Historical Category and the Archaeological Category this year, mainly through elimination of several criteria. The remaining HPF criteria are largely the same as those used in Fiscal Year 2010, which the staff believes continue to work extremely well. Most of the proposed wording changes are minor, and most of them are simply intended to provide clarification or refinement of the criteria.

##### **Administrative**

In the Administrative category beginning on page 3 of your packet, criterion #4 was clarified to provide more detail about how the review of draft National Register nominations must be addressed in project timetables; it also states that the June 30 project deadline is binding and non-negotiable. Another revision simply updated the current number of Certified Local Governments in the state; while a third revision clarified that unsigned support letters will not be counted. One public comment simply gave a favorable approval to the minor changes proposed; no other comments were received.

##### **Architectural & Historical**

In the Architectural & Historical category beginning on page 6 of your packet, a major change is that the DHPA has proposed to remove survey from the competitive grant category and to handle those projects through negotiated cooperative agreements from now on. Due to the in-progress changeover to electronic survey, a funding mechanism is needed that allows for more active dialog, more planning, and more negotiation between the DHPA and survey partners, and cooperative agreements will better meet that need. Funding of the few remaining survey publications will also be handled through cooperative agreements. In light of the removed survey criterion, the point values were increased for the National Register and financial reinvestment criteria. On the list of Historic Districts Targeted for National Register Nomination on page 9, the districts removed are ones currently being undertaken with HPF grant assistance. No public comments were received on this category.

## Acquisition and Development

In the Acquisition & Development category beginning on page 19 of your packet, only the date spread of past development projects to be reported has been updated. No substantive changes or revisions have been proposed. One public comment simply gave a favorable approval to the minor changes proposed; no other comments were received.

## Grant Program Guidelines

In the Grant Program Guidelines (beginning on page 22 of your packet), a few minor changes were incorporated to clarify meanings and instruction and make necessary updates. However, the sliding scale percentages were significantly revised this year in response to the removal of survey from the Architectural & Historical Category. In short, the relative percentage of funds available for the A&H Category has been greatly reduced to reflect the fact that without survey activities, the demand for funds in this category is much lower overall. The set-aside pool of funds for cooperative agreement projects will now be increased to accommodate the planned demand for survey funding. No public comments were received on the Grant Program Guidelines or the Sliding Scale Funding Percentages Chart.

## Archaeological

In the Archaeological category beginning on page 11 of your packet, only one minor wording change was proposed in Subcategory I simply to clarify a meaning. However, the major change to the Archaeological Category this year is the proposed elimination of Subcategory II altogether so as to maintain focus on the primary importance of Subcategory I projects that identify and document site locations as further financial strain is placed on the HPF subgrant program. No revisions were proposed by DHPA for the list of Archaeological Goals and Objectives, but four sites were added to the list of Special Topic Sites. Two public comments with multiple points and suggestions were received on this category.

## Public Comments

Due to the public comments, and the further changes made to the archaeological criteria as a result, I have provided the Review Board with a revised set of the Archaeological evaluation criteria. Changes proposed by the DHPA staff and made available for public comment are indicated in **bold text** or **strikethrough**. Changes made in response to public comments are indicated in **bold text and underlined**.

One member of the public opposed the elimination of Subcategory II. The DHPA staff stands behind its position that Subcategory II has not lived up to its original intentions, which was mainly to foster preparation of National Register nominations for archaeological sites, but the response from the archaeological community has not come close to meeting expectations for adding sites to the Register. In addition, there is relatively little demand for these funds and therefore little competition. So as to keep as much funding available for survey and investigation projects under Subcategory I, staff believes that elimination of Subcategory II is warranted for now, as explained on **page 4**. It may be appropriate to reinstate this subcategory later when there is less external financial strain on the overall funds available for the subgrant program.

On the Archaeological Goals and Objectives, Part II: Cultural Periods and Topics ... it was suggested to remove Vincennes Culture and Western Basin Tradition from the list of Higher Priority Topics on **page 6**. DHPA staff believes these two items should be retained, at least for one more year. An investigation of Western Basin Tradition is currently being funded, so it may be appropriate to lower its level of priority on the list in the near future. It was also suggested to add Late Archaic in the region north of the Wabash River, Riverton-Maples Mills in southeastern Indiana, Crab Orchard, Havana, and Late Prehistoric groups in central and south-central Indiana to the list of Higher Priority Topics. DHPA staff concurs with all of these suggested additions and has added them as indicated in the new handout.

On the list of Special Topic Sites on **page 8**, one citizen disputed the requirement that, if eligible and not already listed, an investigated site from this list must be nominated to the National Register as part of the grant-assisted project. The DHPA staff has not changed its belief that nomination of sites on the Special Topic Sites list is strongly desired. However, to provide clarification of the requirement, the language has been modified to more clearly instruct that preparation of a nomination to the National Register is required only if the site is determined to be eligible as a result of the grant-assisted investigation.

Also on the list of Special Topic Sites, a citizen proposed one addition of a multi-component site; however, the suggestion was not clear enough for staff to be able to understand the citizen's precise intention because the site is actually a cluster of Native American habitation sites around a fort location. Therefore, staff will consult with this person to clarify the suggestion and will consider it for inclusion next year.

Also regarding Special Topic Sites, it was suggested that survey of one of these sites should qualify for the 70/30 funding ratio instead of 50/50. The DHPA addressed this issue last year in a major overhaul of the archaeological criteria that was intended to correct a long-standing pattern of misinterpretation of what qualifies for the more advantageous 70/30 funding ratio. The DHPA explained that only large-scale surveys intended to identify many sites qualified for 70/30 reimbursement. Smaller surveys only intended to identify or refine site boundaries would only qualify for 50/50 reimbursement.

A motion was made to approve by Richard Butler and seconded by Julie Donnell. The motion passed.

## **V. Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification**

### **Listed**

1. Jefferson Union Church and Sweet Cemetery, 3015 E 415 N, Noble Co. (1913)
2. Middletown Historic District, roughly including Locust Street from the 600 block to the 400 block and 5<sup>th</sup> Street from the 100 block of South 5<sup>th</sup> to the 100 block of N. 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Middletown, Henry Co. (2106)

3. Delphi Courthouse Square Historic District, roughly bounded by Monroe, south side of Main, west side of Market, and Indiana Streets, Delphi, Carroll Co. (2132)
4. Forest-Ivanhoe Residential Historic District, roughly bounded by 172<sup>nd</sup> Place, east side of Forest Ave. south to its end, and the Little Calumet River, Hammond, Lake Co. (2136)
5. Plainfield Historic District, roughly bounded by Lincoln Street to the north, S. East Street to the east; Ash Street to the south; and S. Mill to the west, Plainfield, Hendricks Co. (2138)
6. Emerson Heights Historic District, roughly bounded by Emerson Ave., Linwood Ave., E. 10<sup>th</sup> and E. Michigan Streets, Indianapolis, Marion Co. (2151)
7. Jenkins Place, 448-488 Liberty Road, Orleans, Orange Co. (2155)
8. North Jefferson Street Historic District, roughly bounded by West Park Drive and College, Madison, Collins, Oak, Stephen and Buchanan Streets, Huntington, Huntington Co. (2161)
9. Windsor Mound, Randolph Co. (2162)

**Rejected**  
None

**Removed**  
None

### **Ethics Training**

Dr Glass reported that Ethics Training for all Indiana State Employees is required. The deadline for the testing was 4/30/2010.

### **Review Board Training**

Dr Glass also reported that the Review Board Training is in the morning of July 28, 2010. This is for board members new and old who would like to review the responsibility of the board in the process of National Register program, application, nominations, certificates of approval and grants.

**Set date for the next meeting**

The proposed date of the next meeting is July 28, 2010, IGCS, Conference Room A, 1:30 p.m. (EDT).

**Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board Meeting Dates for 2010**

Mark your calendars reminder for meeting dates.  
Wednesday, October 27, 2010

All meetings are in Conference room "A", unless otherwise noted above.  
All meetings are reserved for a starting time of 1:30 PM to 4:45 PM.

**Deadline for receipt of Certificate of Approval applications:**

Friday, June 18, 2010, 4:45 p.m. (EDT)

Vice- Chairman Newman adjourned the meeting at 2:55 P.M. (EDT).