

United States Department of the Interior  
National Park Service

FINAL

National Register of Historic Places  
Registration Form

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations for individual properties and districts. See instructions in How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the information requested. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer, to complete all items.

1. Name of Property

historic name Sheffield Inn  
other names/site number Sheffield Apartments

2. Location

street & number 956-58 N. Pennsylvania St. N/A  not for publication  
city or town Indianapolis N/A  vicinity  
state Indiana code IN county Marion code 097 zip code 46204

3. State/Federal Agency Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended, I hereby certify that this  nomination  request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36CFR Part 60. In my opinion, the property  meets  does not meet the National Register criteria. I recommend that this property be considered significant  nationally  statewide  locally. (  See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

[Signature] 2/10/78  
Signature of certifying official/Title Date

Indiana Department of Natural Resources  
State or Federal agency and bureau

In my opinion, the property  meets  does not meet the National Register criteria. (  See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of certifying official/Title Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
State or Federal agency and bureau

4. National Park Service Certification

I hereby certify that the property is:  
 entered in the National Register.  
 See continuation sheet.  
 determined eligible for the National Register  
 See continuation sheet.  
 determined not eligible for the National Register  
 removed from the National Register  
 other, (explain:) \_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of the Keeper Date of Action

Sheffield Inn

Marion IN  
County and State

Name of Property

5. Classification

Ownership of Property  
(Check as many boxes as apply)

Category of Property  
(Check only one box)

Number of Resources within Property  
(Do not include previously listed resources in the count)

- private
- public-local
- public-State
- public-Federal

- building
- district
- site
- structure
- object

Contributing	Noncontributing	
1	0	buildings
0	0	sites
0	0	structures
0	0	objects
1	0	Total

Name of related multiple property listing  
(Enter "N/A" if property is not part of a multiple property listing.)

Number of contributing resources previously listed  
in the National Register

N/A

0

6. Function or Use

Historic Functions  
(Enter categories from instructions)

Current Functions  
(Enter categories from instructions)

DOMESTIC: Hotel

DOMESTIC: Multiple Dwelling

WORK IN PROGRESS

7. Description

Architectural Classification  
(Enter categories from instructions)

Materials  
(Enter categories from instructions)

19th & 20th c. REVIVALS: Tudor Revival

foundation BRICK

walls BRICK  
STUCCO

roof STONE: Slate

other WOOD

Narrative Description

(Describe the historic and current condition of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

**8. Statement of Significance**

**Applicable National Register Criteria**

(Mark "x" in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for National Register listing.)

- A** Property is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- B** Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- C** Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.
- D** Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

**Criteria Considerations**

(Mark "x" in all the boxes that apply.)

Property is:

- A** owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes.
- B** removed from its original location.
- C** a birthplace or grave.
- D** a cemetery.
- E** a reconstructed building, object, or structure.
- F** a commemorative property.
- G** less than 50 years of age or achieved significance within the past 50 years.

**Areas of Significance**

(Enter categories from instructions)

ARCHITECTURE

**Period of Significance**

1927

**Significant Dates**

1927

**Significant Person**

(Complete if Criterion B is marked above)

N/A

**Cultural Affiliation**

N/A

**Architect/Builder**

Fitton, Harry R.

**Narrative Statement of Significance**

(Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

**9. Major Bibliographic References**

**Bibliography**

(Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form on one or more continuation sheets.)

Previous documentation on file (NPS):

- preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested
- previously listed in the National Register
- previously determined eligible by the National Register
- designated a National Historic Landmark
- recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey # \_\_\_\_\_
- recorded by Historic American Engineering Record # \_\_\_\_\_

**Primary location of additional data:**

- State Historic Preservation Office
- Other State agency
- Federal agency
- Local government
- University
- Other

Name of repository:

Indiana State Library & Archives

Sheffield Inn  
Name of Property

Marion IN  
County and State

## 10. Geographical Data

Acreeage of Property <1

### UTM References

(Place additional UTM references on a continuation sheet.)

1	1 6	5 7 2 2 8 0	4 4 0 3 5 3 0	3			
	Zone	Easting	Northing		Zone	Easting	Northing
2				4			

See continuation sheet

### Verbal Boundary Description

(Describe the boundaries of the property on a continuation sheet.)

### Boundary Justification

(Explain why the boundaries were selected on a continuation sheet.)

## 11. Form Prepared By

name/title William L. Selm, Consultant for  
organization Manchester Associates, LP date 7-21-97  
street & number 401 E. 41st St. telephone 317-283-7820  
city or town Indianapolis state IN zip code 46205

## Additional Documentation

Submit the following items with the completed form:

### Continuation Sheets

#### Maps

A **USGS map** (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's location.

A **Sketch map** for historic districts and properties having large acreage or numerous resources.

#### Photographs

Representative **black and white** photographs of the property.

### Additional items

(Check with the SHPO or FPO for any additional items)

## Property Owner

(Complete this item at the request of SHPO or FPO.)

name Manchester Associates, LP  
street & number 120 E. Vermont St. telephone 317-464-2434  
city or town Indianapolis state IN zip code 46204

**Paperwork Reduction Act Statement:** This information is being collected for applications to the National Register of Historic Places to nominate properties for listing or determine eligibility for listing, to list properties and to amend existing listings. Response to this request is required to obtain a benefit in accordance with the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended (16 U.S.C. 470 *et seq.*).

**Estimated Burden Statement:** Public reporting burden for this form is estimated to average 18.1 hours per response including time for reviewing instructions, gathering and maintaining data, and completing and reviewing the form. Direct comments regarding this burden estimate or any aspect of this form to the Chief, Administrative Services Division, National Park Service, P.O. Box 37127, Washington, DC 20013-7127; and the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reductions Projects (1024-0018), Washington, DC 20503.

SHEFFIELD INN

---

DESCRIPTION

The Sheffield Inn (the Sheffield) is a residential building located on the west side of the 900 block of North Pennsylvania Street. Immediately to the north and abutting the Sheffield is the three-story brick Manchester Apartments of 1929, and abutting to the south is a two-story commercial building of 1965. **(Photos #1 and #2)** The immediate neighborhood, the St. Joseph Neighborhood, is composed of a mixture of Civil War-era houses and cottages, pre-Depression era apartment buildings of the twentieth century, commercial buildings from the nineteenth century to the present and a number of vacant and parking lots. Many buildings in the neighborhood are listed in the National Register of Historic Places either as individual buildings, as part of the Apartments and Flats of Downtown Indianapolis (1983) or in the St. Joseph Neighborhood Historic District (1991).

The Sheffield is a two-story, residential building of solid masonry construction. Brick faces the tile block walls and wood framing composes the floors and roof structure. The footprint of the Sheffield is roughly that of an "I", filling up most of the rectangular shape of the lot, allowing for light courts on both the north and south sides. The major portion of the building is conventional and unadorned in sharp contrast to the main facade facing North Pennsylvania Street

Exterior

The Sheffield is almost two different buildings put together; the quaint highly detailed picturesque front with its multi-gabled roof clad in slate, decorative chimney, pent roof, half timbering and banks of leaded quarrel windows with heraldic insets; and the nondescript functional rear wing with its flat roof housing the rooms. **(Photos #3, #4 & #5)** The Sheffield's main facade and lobby interior exhibit the Tudor Revival Style with overall design and fine detailing.

The main facade of the Sheffield projects the image of a quaint English inn dating from the Tudor period or before. The first floor is faced with brick, the second floor with faux half timbering. The bricks are unique in that each has been distressed with the chipping of edges to give an aged appearance. **(Photos #6 & #7)** The main facade is composed of a massive slate-clad gable roof with a large projecting gabled pavilion, perpendicular to the main facade. This two-and-a-half-story pavilion has an A-frame shape created by the roof planes sloping down to the first story level. The first floor is pierced by two entrances with blind arches bricked in. The two doors flank a large bank of eight casement windows in two tiers within a shallow bay. Five of the original windows in their wood sashes have survived with their twenty-two panes of clear glass with a centered art glass heraldic shield all framed by leaded comes. Three of the windows are replacements with single panes of glass. Above the bay, at the second story are two centered window openings each with three replacement aluminum-sash double-hung windows. Above the

SHEFFIELD INN

---

second story windows is the half-timber gable apex with posts, beams and arched braces framing the two centered, decorative casement windows which have retained their original lead-camed quarrels. **(Photo #7)**

A massive decorative brick and stucco chimney surmounted by two terra cotta chimney pots is the axis, separating the pavilion from the southern half of the facade. The southern half is distinctive for its two half-timbered gables above the two second-story windows. Each window opening is filled by three double-hung aluminum sash windows. The first-story entrances and windows are shaded by a slate-clad pent roof. A brick pier separates the two shopfront bays consisting of a door and steel sash multi-paned shop windows, all surmounted by square, wood-sash casement windows with twenty panes framed by leaded comes. Other surviving details include the original arched shop front doors, copper gutters, downspouts and leader boxes. The shopfronts have been covered over by stucco board panels, but the windows are intact.

The Tudor Revival details and materials extend around the south wall of the Sheffield with the full gable roof, half timbering and the decorative bricks. The gable roof is not merely decorative but is a true gable roof with a western slope out of view from the street, giving the appearance of being a complete building with a functional rear wing. **(Photo #2)** The rear two-story wing accommodating the bulk of the residential units has a flat roof, brick faced with no decorative details. The brick is conventional without the distress detail so prominent on the main facade. Windows and a rear entrance pierce the rear (west) wall on the alley (Cleveland Street). **(Photos #4 & #5)** All of the original wood sash, double hung windows were replaced by aluminum sash windows in 1971. The second-story replacement windows on the main facade date from this time as do the panels covering the shop windows.

Interior

The Tudor Revival Style is strongly expressed in the interior of the public areas of the Sheffield, specifically in the lobby and the commercial areas. The lobby is finely appointed with a slate floor, board wainscoting, bay window bench, ceiling beams, rough finish plaster walls and ceiling, segmented arched openings, tiled entry ways and landings, original doors, a half-timbered frieze and a Tudor-arched limestone framed fireplace with its original grate. **(Photos #8 & #9)**

From the lobby radiate doorways to the paneled-and-beamed ceiling manager's office, stairway to the second level, stairway to the raised first-floor level and to the commercial space to the south. The commercial space has survived as a maintenance and storage area since the 1971 renovation. However, the beamed ceiling, half-timbered frieze, wainscoting, doors of the commercial space has survived despite the built-in storage cabinets and wall partition.

SHEFFIELD INN

---

The two floors of rooms were radically remodeled in 1971 resulting in the removal or covering of interior partitions, woodwork, doors, hardware, wall and ceiling plaster finishes, fixtures and flooring. The Sheffield's original thirty-three units, ranging from efficiencies to two bedroom suites, were remodeled into twenty-four units, most of them one-bedroom apartments. Only the central corridors on both floors have retained their configuration, but all of the corridor finishes have been altered. **( Photo # 10)** The second story corridor has glazed sky lights. The rear stairwell has its original wooden newel posts and square-cut balusters. **(Photo # 11)** The basement retains its utilitarian character and function of storage and utility rooms.

SHEFFIELD INN

---

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The Sheffield Inn ( the Sheffield) is significant under Criterion C, as the work of architect Harry R. Fitton and as a fine example of the Tudor Revival Style, exhibiting exceptional craftsmanship. Fitton's original design employed domestic architectural style, scale and detailing to face an otherwise basic multi-unit residential building. The Sheffield, until recently an apartment building, was originally designed as a residential hotel located only one mile from the very center of the city in an area noted for its mix of uses and for its collection of historic apartment buildings.

The Sheffield was constructed in 1926-1927 as a small residential hotel with a small commercial street front area. Architect Fitton designed the Sheffield in the popular Tudor Revival Style at the height of the style's popularity before the Great Depression. Harry R. Fitton (1884-1931) was an active architect in Indianapolis between 1910 and 1931. He not only was an accomplished architect, he was also a partner in firms that developed, designed, constructed, owned and managed buildings throughout the city and state during the two decades before the Great Depression. The Sheffield stood out as one of Fitton's projects cited in his biography and obituary.<sup>1</sup>

Fitton was born in Evansville, Indiana, a direct descendant of Robert Dale Owen of New Harmony fame. He was educated at Culver Military Academy (graduated 1903), and studied architectural engineering at Purdue University (1904-1906). By 1905, Fitton was working for an Indianapolis real estate firm.<sup>2</sup> In November of 1910, Fitton was one of the founders of the Builders Real Estate Company (BREC), with the purpose "to build, construct and erect buildings and houses". Fitton served as vice president and treasurer with architect Lawrence W. George as president.<sup>3</sup> BREC was a construction, development and design firm, listed by 1913 in the city directory under both headings of "architects" and "real estate". By 1914 Fitton served as a partner of both BREC and of the architecture firm of George, MacLucas & Fitton.<sup>4</sup> In this period Fitton and his associates were very active developing upscale residences on the city's north side, including several in what is now the Meridian Park Historic District (NRHP, 1990).<sup>5</sup> George, MacLucas, and Fitton are also credited with impressive structures such as the 1916 Balmoral Court Apartments at 3055 North Meridian Street, the 1921 Saville Apartments at 1701 North Illinois (demolished), and the 1917 Delaware Court at 1001-1015 North Delaware Street.<sup>6</sup>

In 1917 BREC changed its name to Builders Construction Company (BCC) and added Owen M. Mothershead as a director and as its secretary-treasurer. By 1921, George was no longer associated with BCC and Fitton served as president. Mothershead and Fitton reorganized BCC in 1924 as Mothershead and Fitton (M&F) with John F. Ross serving as director and general superintendent. M&F continued not only the development of upscale housing but in all types of

SHEFFIELD INN

---

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

structures. It was an active participant in the economic and building boom of the 1920s, ending with the Great Depression. In a 1929 advertisement, M&F stated, "We specialize in the design and construction of industrial and commercial and apartment houses."<sup>7</sup> Fitton's biography lists to his credit the design of the factories for Beveridge Paper Co., Fairbanks-Morse Co., Rockwood Manufacturing Co., and the Pittman-Moore Co. He also served as architect for Culver Military Academy.<sup>8</sup> The Indiana Construction Recorder credits M&F with design of the office and factory addition to Lilly Varnish Co.<sup>9</sup>

Fitton's partner Owen Morrison Mothershead (1880-1957) was an Indianapolis native. A graduate of Cornell University (B.S., 1902), he began his association with Fitton in 1916.<sup>10</sup> As secretary and treasurer of M&F, Mothershead "handled the business matters of the firm."<sup>11</sup> Mothershead and Fitton organized and incorporated Sheffield Realty Company on January 2, 1926,<sup>12</sup> following their announcement to construct the Sheffield Inn as a residential hotel. The Indiana Construction Recorder reported that M&F were not only owners but architect and builder as well.<sup>13</sup> The Sheffield Realty Co. purchased the site of the Sheffield on January 6, 1926, with plans in progress. Work progressed rapidly with the demolition of the existing nineteenth century residence on the site by January 30.<sup>14</sup> The Sheffield was completed and in service in 1927. When completed, the Sheffield had thirty-three rooms consisting of efficiencies and one-and-two-bedroom suites. The Sheffield also had a large common lobby appointed in the Tudor Revival Style and a small restaurant/coffee shop/lounge.

The Great Depression began in 1929 and had an immediate impact on builders, developers, and architects. By 1930, M&F had disappeared from the city directory, but the firm of Harry R. Fitton Co. was occupying the office area of the neighboring Manchester Apartments. The disappearance of M&F from the city directory supports the statement in the obituary of Owen M. Mothershead's son, Wilson, that "the family business became a casualty of the Depression."<sup>15</sup> Fitton's office closed after his death on April 6, 1931.<sup>16</sup> Mothershead & Fitton filed its last annual report to the Indiana Secretary of State's office in 1929.<sup>17</sup> The Sheffield continued to serve as a residential hotel with its commercial function as a cocktail lounge and restaurant. El Dee Apartments purchased the Sheffield in 1970 and remodeled it in 1971 into twenty-four low-income, subsidized apartments.

The 900 block of North Pennsylvania Street and the area now known as the St. Joseph Neighborhood had been in a state of transition for the two decades before the construction of the Sheffield. As the central business district of Indianapolis grew in the period immediately before the First World War and immediately following in the 1920s, nineteenth century single-family

## SHEFFIELD INN

---

housing was razed to make way for apartment buildings and the ever-encroaching commercial district. The St. Joseph Neighborhood and the Old North Side, immediately to the north, saw the proliferation of apartment houses and some residential hotels. The Sheffield Inn contributed to the reshaping of the neighborhood, providing residential units and commercial retail space, easily accessible from the street. The design of the Sheffield provided for thirty-three rooms with a stylish common lobby detailed to continue the strong English Tudor character established in the facade design. The lobby has a bay bench, wainscoting, rough-finish plaster, slate flagstone floor, ceiling beams and a fireplace. Two small commercial spaces served at various times the offices of Mothershead and Fitton and the Sheffield Inn Coffeeshop as well as other tenants over time. These two shop fronts were also detailed in the Tudor Revival style with ceiling beams, wainscoting and rough finish plaster ceiling and wall finish. With the obvious success of the Sheffield Inn, M&F planned for a repeat performance. They planned and constructed (1929) a companion building the Manchester Apartments, immediately to the north.

The Sheffield was designed in the Tudor Revival Style which was extremely popular nationally and in Indianapolis in the 1920s. The revival styles, Colonial and Tudor, had replaced the Craftsman/Arts and Crafts style which had enjoyed the popularity of upscale clients the decade before. Fitton employed the popular Tudor Revival Style to produce a significantly different residential hotel/apartment urban building on the frontier of the encroaching commercial area on the established nineteenth century residential area. North Pennsylvania Street and North Delaware Street were lined with large houses from the 1860s and 1870s as illustrated by three notable survivors nearby, the Kemper House (c. 1873 at 1028 North Delaware St.), the Bals-Wocher House (c. 1869 at North Delaware St.), and the Calvin I. Fletcher House (c. 1898 at 1031 North Delaware St.).<sup>18</sup> Many apartment houses had been constructed in the St. Joseph area such as The Chadwick (1924, 1005 North Pennsylvania St.), The Pennsylvania (1906, 1919 North Pennsylvania St.), The Lodge (1905, 829 North Pennsylvania St.), and at least one residential hotel, the Hotel Pennsylvania (c. 1935, 947 North Pennsylvania St.).<sup>19</sup> Their massing, sizes, materials and styles express the function of an apartment building or hotel.

The Sheffield's design deviates from the previously established hotel design with its residential size, styling and the inclusion of commercial shop and office space easily accessible from the street. The Sheffield was designed with two commercial spaces, each with its own storefront and entrance. The combination of hotels and commercial use is not new as numerous commercial buildings of the nineteenth century were hotels above first floor commercial space. The Sheffield does not fit this mold as it was designed with a residential scaled and detailed facade masking the functional residential wing hidden from the street view. This successful design is not found anywhere else in Indianapolis.

SHEFFIELD INN

---

The Sheffield's Tudor Revival street fronted public wing has changed very little despite the total remodeling that occurred in the residential rear wing. A comparison with historic photographs records that the distinctive character envisioned by Fitton enriched by fine detailing has survived and continues to enhance the streetscape of this transitional historic streetscape.<sup>20</sup>

ENDNOTES

1. Kin Hubbard, A Book of Indiana (Indianapolis: Indiana Biographical Assoc., 1929), pp. 333 & 371; and "Death Believed Due to Heart Disease or Acute Indigestion," Indianapolis Star, April 7, 1931.
2. Ibid.
3. Articles of Association, Builders Real Estate Co., 1910, Mothershead & Fitton File, Indiana State Archives (ISA), Indianapolis, IN.
4. R.L. Polk & Co., Indianapolis City Directory (Indianapolis: R.L. Polk & Co., 1914).
5. Suzanne T. Rollins, Meridian Park Historic District, National Register of Historic Places Nomination, U.S. Department of the Interior. Listed February 2, 1990.
6. Susan R. Slade, Balmoral Court, National Register of Historic Places Nomination, U.S. Department of the Interior. Listed November 27, 1992.
7. Polk, 1929.
8. Hubbard.
9. "News of the Week," Indiana Construction Recorder (ICR), February 6, 1926.
10. Kate Milner Rabb & William Herschell, eds., An Account of Indianapolis and Marion County (Dayton, OH: Dayton Historical Publishing Co., 1924), Vol. 4, p. 586-587.
11. "Owen M. Mothershead," Indianapolis News, November 20, 1957.
12. Index of Corporations, 1920-1929, Indiana Secretary of State, ISA.
13. "News of the Week", ICR , December 26, 1925, p. 7.
14. Ibid., January 30, 1926, p. 7.

SHEFFIELD INN

---

15. "Wilson Mothershead 84, Former INB Chief," Indianapolis Star, April 18, 1990, p. 8.
16. "Death Believed Due to Heart Disease or Acute Indigestion," Indianapolis Star, April 7, 1931.
17. Annual Report, 1929, Mothershead & Fitton File, ISA.
18. All three houses are individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places.
19. All but the Hotel Pennsylvania, now named Lucille Raines Residence, are listed in the National Register of Historic Places as part of the Apartments and Flats of Downtown Indianapolis Thematic Resources of 1983.
20. Photograph Negative # 266773-F-1 & 2, May 13, 1946, Bass Photo Collection, Indiana Historical Society Library, Indianapolis, IN.

SHEFFIELD INN

---

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Baist, G. Wm. Real Estate Atlas Surveys of Indianapolis and Vicinity, Indiana. Philadelphia: G. Wm. Baist, 1927.

Bass Photo Collection. Indiana Historical Society Library Indianapolis.

Hubbard, Kin. A Book of Indiana. Indianapolis: Indiana Biographical Association, 1929.

Indiana Construction Recorder. December 26, 1925, January 30, 1926, February 6, 1926, and August 4, 1928.

Indiana State Archives. Index of Corporations, 1920-1929.

Indiana State Archives. Mothershead & Fitton File.

Indianapolis News. November 20, 1957.

Indianapolis Star. April 7, 1931 and April 18, 1990.

Marion County Recorder's Office, Indianapolis. Land Records.

National Register of Historic Places Nominations, Indiana Division of Historic Preservation & Archaeology, Indianapolis.

Polk, R.L. & Co. Indianapolis City Directory. Indianapolis: R.L. Polk & Co., 1914, 1929, & 1930.

Rabb, Kate Milner and William Herschell, eds. An Account of Indianapolis and Marion County. Dayton, OH: Dayton Historical Publishing Co., 1924.

National Register of Historic Places  
Continuation Sheet  
Section number: 10 Page: 10

SHEFFIELD INN

---

Verbal Boundary Description

The Sheffield occupies all of J.R. Pratt's Subdivision Lot 3, Outlot 172.

Boundary Justification

The real estate described in the Verbal Boundary Description (above) is the property on which sits the Sheffield, owned by the stated owners of record.